Stephan A. Maffia, P.E.
Consulting Engineer
103 South Vacation Drive
Wappingers Falls, NY 12590

September 27, 2023

Robert Pollock
P.O. Box 444
Milton, NY 12547

Re: Responses to Planning Board Member Comments
Buttermilk Falls
Town of Marlborough, New York

Dear Mr. Pollock:

As requested, I am providing my responses to comments made by Planning Board member James Garofalo in an undated document provided by the Planning Board Secretary in a September 7, 2023 email. That document is attached to this letter for ease of reference.

Each comment in the Garofalo document was assigned a letter or number and my responses are keyed to those assignments without repeating the entire comment.

Responses:

Inter-Governmental Coordination

A. The intersection of Route 9W and Milton Road is in the Town of Lloyd. It was included in the impact study because it was on an obvious route for traffic generated by the site to/from the north.

B. The comment suggests that a left turn lane warrant analysis should be conducted based on the results of Roadway Safety Audit that included the area of Route 9W at/near the Milton Road intersection. The audit listed 18 accidents at/near the intersection in a five-year period from 2012 to 2016. While the total may appear to be significant, a closer review was needed. The audit information was further broken down by year, by number of vehicles involved and finally by type. This closer look revealed that there were seven accidents in 2012, four accidents in 2013, four accidents in 2014, one accident in 2015 and two accidents in 2016. The decreasing number of annual accidents is not an indication of a significant safety condition.

   Broken down by number of vehicles involved (with type) gave eight single vehicle accidents in the five-year period – five were deer/animal strikes and three were loss of control. This left 10 accidents in the five-year period as follows: three in 2012, three in 2013, two in 2014, one in 2015 and one in 2016. Again, the decreasing number of annual accidents is not an indication of a significant safety condition. However, nine of the 10 accidents were rear-end accidents and one was an overtake/passing. While numerically the accidents are not significant, the type of accident is one that would bear monitoring. Since Route 9W is a State road, it would be within the DOT's jurisdiction, and they would determine the need for any modifications to the intersection. In my professional opinion, neither the accident experience nor the traffic volumes would warrant a left turn lane on Route 9W at Milton Road. (Note: according to the AASHTO Standards for left-turn lanes, with the projected advancing and opposing traffic on 9W with traffic from the proposed project, the left turn volumes would have to be over 200

vehicles during the peak hours. Projected peak hour southbound left-turn volumes average only 38 vehicles.)

C. In my opinion, the 4% growth factor is a more than adequate increase to apply to existing traffic on Route 9W. First, the build condition year is 2025 and only one other development – Bayside – may be complete and occupied before 2025. There is no evidence that other major residential developments (like Dockside) will be occupied before that time. Second, the two residential developments cited are 5 to 6 miles south of the Buttermilk Falls study area and only a portion of traffic from those projects would reach the intersections to the north that were analyzed in my study. Finally, the traffic study by Tim Miller Associates for the Dockside project used a 1.5% annual growth rate as compared to the 2.0% rate used for Buttermilk Falls.

D. See response to Item 21.

E. N/A

Detailed Comments

1. The site plan shows the proposed accesses and that has not changed. There is only one proposed access on Van Orden Road – not two as stated in the comment. There are three proposed new accesses to North Road and two existing driveways. There is only one new access on Mahoney Road – not three as stated in the comment. The open access area on Mahoney is to accommodate parking adjacent to a proposed storage building. This could be modified during site plan review if required by the Town.

2. The difference in trips are those that were assigned to Van Orden Road. The Van Orden trips total less than ten or fewer total entering/exiting vehicles during each of the three hours analyzed – Friday Evening, Friday Night and Saturday Midday.

3. The overlapping access conditions were necessary because the new main access is proposed to be built opposite Mahoney Road and is not present in the existing and no-build scenarios. Each scenario and time frame are clearly identified and referenced in the Figure title.

4. The small font numbers are part of my traffic modelling process placed there in an Excel spreadsheet to ensure that there are balanced traffic volumes between intersections. They do not affect any Level of Service analysis.

5. Descriptions of pavement conditions were based on field observations. In my experience, State pavement data reports are not necessary for the analyses provided in the traffic study.

6. The requested DOT count data is in fact included in Appendix A. The values are the exact numbers provided in the State's Traffic Data Viewer for that section of Route 9W, by hour for a 24-hour period.

7. Both count sources are identified in the text of the report on page 4 – DOT from 2017 and manual counts from 2023. The comparable volumes are based on PM peak hour (evening) counts as follows: 2017 DOT – 1,721 vehicles total and 2023 Manual Counts – 1,674.

8. The footnote in Table 2 describes the methodology for the banquet hall trip estimate. The occupancy value was based on a review of various Town parking codes including

Marlborough's 1 space per 3.5 seats in an auditorium and 1 space per 3 seats in a restaurant, and Newburgh's 1 space per 3 seats in an auditorium, church, convention hall, etc.

9. The truck data was from the DOT 2017 count.

10. Large attendance at the banquet hall would occur primarily on Saturday evening and Sunday afternoon when traffic on the adjacent streets is significantly lower than during the peak times evaluated in the study. Also, at those off-peak times, there would be less traffic generated by the other uses within the site – including the restaurant, spa and other lodging uses.

11. Route 9W and North Road are identified as the northbound/southbound movements in the Tables and Mahoney Road/Milton Road are the eastbound/westbound movements.

12. The applicant would manage the facility to provide conditions that give visitors the best experience possible. It is simply good business practice and plentiful parking, and easy access are part of that practice.

13. There is no weekend traffic volume data available from DOT for Route 9W in Marlborough. However, the following was provided by DOT for a recent study I prepared for a proposed U-Haul on Route 9W:

2011 NYS DOT 24-Hour Count – Route 9W near Union Avenue, New Windsor			
Direction	Weekday Volume	Saturday Volume	Sunday Volume
Northbound	10,176	8,583	6,400
Southbound	16,156	13,969	10,711
Total	26,332	22,552	17,111

14. 2020

15. None.

16. Some potential banked parking areas are open grassed field areas and existing gravel areas just north of the ponds near the center of the site.

17. Valet parking will generally be accommodated in the new lots on both sides of North Road at Mahoney Road. That service will replace the existing valet system.

18. Please read roadway descriptions on page 3 of the traffic report. There is no parking on Van Orden Road and the pavement is ±20 feet wide.

19. Noted.

20. The traffic count sheets in the Appendix are not confusing. They are spreadsheet summaries where the raw count data was input in order to determine peak hour volume information by movement and approach at the study intersections during the three study time frames. They are my tools used to convert two-hour field counts to peak hour values to use in subsequent studies. They are my design and are not subject to change.

21. Minor differences in volume inputs are due to computer rounding and the aforementioned assignment of a few trips to Van Orden Road. Otherwise note that all of the remaining trip generation was applied to the main driveway opposite Mahoney Road, which produced the

most conservative results in terms of Level of Service. Slight changes in volumes would not alter these results.

22. The difference in volume on Mahoney Road between Route 9W and North Road is 5 eastbound vehicles and 5 westbound vehicles Friday evening. Adjusting the vehicles at the intersections would balance the volumes between them but do nothing to change the results of the analysis.

23. The analysis showed an increase in the average delay time due to an increase of 14 vehicles on Mahoney Road at Route 9W, all projected to make left turns at that intersection. The left turn movement from a side road at a stop controlled intersection is highly sensitive to small changes in volume. This is the case at Mahoney Road under Friday evening build conditions. For this short period of time – one hour or less – this condition may be considered acceptable. Note that those delays would occur only during the peak Friday evening time, while at all other times during the day and on the weekends, conditions would be better.

Let me know if you have any questions. Thank you.

Sincerely,

Stephan A. Maffia, P.E.
Principal

SAMPE Responses 9-26-23 Buttermilk Falls